

**CLIMATE CHANGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MEETING MINUTES
February 26, 2019
10:00 a.m. – 3:00 p.m.
Conference Room 105
Rachel Carson State Office Building**

MEMBERS/ALTERNATES PRESENT:

Chairperson Mark Hammond	Representative Steve McCarter
Vice-Chairperson Steve Krug	Steve Morris (for Rep. McCarter in PM)
Grant Gulibon (for Luke Brubaker)	Timothy Vickey (for Rep. Ryan Bizzarro)
Jaret Gibbons	Robert Graff
Zachery Smith	Zakia Elliot
Patrick Henderson	Lindsay Baxter
Terry Bossert	Joseph Sherrick (for Gladys Brown)
Sara Nicholas (for Cindy Dunn)	Adam Walters (for Dennis Davin)
Gary Merritt	Leda Lacomba (for Rep. Marty Causer)

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Marc Mondor	James Felmlee
Alissa Burger	

PA DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION (DEP) STAFF:

Jessica Shirley, Kerry Campbell, Allen Landis, Lindsay Byron, Christopher Noble, David Althoff, John Krueger, Dennis Maloskey, Heidi Kunka, Keith Salador

INVITED GUESTS: Julien Gaudion (DGS)

MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC:

Angel Lorah, Treasure Hoffman, Ellen Kramer, Lawrence McKnight, Emily Bert, Sean Wenrich, Paige Perucci, Frank Pryzbylowski, Deb McCarter, Steve Morrison, Bob Barkanic, Andrew Dwelig, Evan Endres, David Hess

MEETING:

The February 26th, 2019, meeting of the Climate Change Advisory Committee (CCAC) was called to order at 10:16 a.m. by Chairperson Mark Hammond. With 16 of 20 seated members present at the start of the meeting, a quorum was established.

MINUTES:

The minutes of the December 4th, 2018, CCAC meeting were presented to the committee to approve. A motion to accept the minutes, with a minor change put forth by Lindsay Baxter, was made by Steve Krug while Robert Graff seconded. The motion carried by a voice vote and passed unanimously.

MEETING SUMMARY: (This narrative provides a summary of the discussions that took place during the meeting. It is not a transcript of the proceedings.)

Governor's Executive Order and GreenGov Council Overview

Julien Gaudion, Dept. of General Services (DGS), Deputy Secretary Property and Asset Management gave a presentation regarding Executive Order 2019-01 as it relates to the commonwealth as well as the formation of the GreenGov Council.

Julien explained that DGS is assisting commonwealth agencies in attaining an overall energy reduction of 3% per year, as well as having a collective agency goal of 21% reduction by 2025. Julien presented a snapshot of the EnergyCAP Utility Bill Management Platform that has been developed, which allows DGS to review and track energy use in commonwealth buildings. It currently can track electricity and natural gas consumption. However, the platform will be expanded in the future to show data for water consumption, waste generation, as well as fuel use for fleet vehicles. Eventually, EnergyCAP will allow the public or facility managers to drill down and see how their facility and even their district is doing as far as energy consumption. EnergyCAP tracking will go live in April 2019.

Julien stated the energy efficiency of commonwealth buildings has increased by 11%, and their electricity consumption has dropped by 4.5% each year for a combined 9% reduction in the previous two fiscal years.

Through the year 2022, DGS will save \$27 million in electricity rates, utilizing the same amount of electricity as now. The average electricity rate has dropped from above 5.7 cents/kwh to 5.2 cents/kwh, which includes transmission, capacity and ancillary.

Julien commented that one requirement of the Executive Order is to upgrade infrastructure and improve energy efficiency, which has led to reinvigorating the Guaranteed Energy Savings Act (GESAs) program. There are currently nine GESAs projects in various stages of development with a total project investment of \$84.9 million and a minimum annual savings of \$4.6 million. Some of these projects are replacing boilers, chillers, pumps and lights across all agencies. By September 2019, DGS will have converted 35,000 lights to LED.

Julien explained the funding for these projects does not come from taxpayers. Rather, the projects are paid from the energy savings that result. DGS was also able to get the funding at a rate well below 4% interest. The chiller replacement that was done in the Capitol complex had a project budget of \$18 million with a minimum annual savings of \$1.9 million. Projects like this are also offset by the lighting retrofits, which see a faster return on investment than larger projects.

Robert Graff stated that he would like to see the commonwealth increase resources for the training of building operators, so that energy efficient buildings can be run in the manner they were intended.

There was also brief discussion on how Pennsylvania has already met one of the requirements in Executive Order 2019-01. Forty percent of the electricity for commonwealth buildings is already offset via Renewable Energy Credit (REC) purchases, which only cost \$250,000. Pennsylvania is now the #1 state in the nation for green power purchases. These RECs are not necessarily generated by sources located in PA. The committee discussed the implications of this.

Jessica Shirley, Director of DEP Policy Office, led an overview of the Executive Order itself and how it pertains to policy for the commonwealth. Robert Graff asked for a clarification on the language in the order regarding 25% of the state fleet vehicles transitioning to Electric Vehicles

(EV). Julien referred to DGS' transportation procurement manager, who he suggested speak at the April CCAC meeting regarding the commonwealth vehicle fleet.

Jessica also explained that the Order re-establishes the GreenGov Council, which is a small unit that will be responsible for the GreenGov program. This unit will coordinate with various agencies to push sustainability and energy initiatives such as lighting retrofits, installing EV chargers at state parks, solar panel projects, etc.

Terry Bossert and Mark Hammond complimented the efforts of the commonwealth to lead by example with the Order and expressed their hopes that the forward momentum will be maintained and enable further gains in energy efficiency.

Lindsay Baxter asked for an update regarding the petition that was submitted to the EQB. It was submitted by Robert McKinstry, Clean Air Council and other co-petitioners and involved the creation of a cap and trade program for PA greenhouse gases. The petition was submitted in November. Jessica Shirley stated that the earliest it would be considered by the EQB would be at the April EQB meeting. If it is accepted, then DEP would have 60 days to evaluate the petition and prepare a report for the EQB.

DEP Staff Update:

Lindsay Byron, DEP Energy Office, Environmental Group Manager, presented an addition to the Energy Programs Office, Heidi Kunka, who then provided a brief background.

2018 Climate Action Plan (CAP) – Status Update:

Lindsay Byron gave a brief overview of the comments that DEP received regarding the CAP. One hundred and eighty comments were provided by 7 CCAC members. Lindsay Byron also gave an update as to where the CAP is in the approval process. Jessica Shirley explained that, once the CAP is completed, it will be shared with the CCAC, and they will have two weeks to review and provide letter with comments. Those letters will be part of the appendices.

Various members stated that they would appreciate if DEP would allow more than two weeks to review the CAP. There was discussion about whether or not this request would be feasible by DEP. Patrick Henderson made a motion that the CCAC formally request four weeks for the CAP review, and the motion was seconded by Robert Graff. The motion was voted on via roll call and passed unanimously with two abstentions, Joe Sherrick and Adam Walters.

2018 Impacts Assessment Update:

Kerry Campbell, DEP Energy Office, Environmental Program Manager gave an update on the 2018 Impacts Assessment that will be completed by Penn State. The 2018 Impacts Assessment will have three focus areas:

- Agriculture,
- Infrastructure, and
- Water Quality.

These focus areas will be broken down into the following three topics:

- Implications of climate change for planning, policies, and practices to achieve Pennsylvania's obligations under the 2011 Chesapeake Bay Total Maximum Daily Loads

(TMDLs)

- Climate change impacts on Pennsylvania livestock production and livestock production impacts on water quality
- Resilience of Pennsylvania's critical infrastructure to extreme weather and climate events

The assessment will focus on the current Chesapeake Bay TMDL's for nitrogen, phosphorus and other nutrients and whether those TMDL's are still applicable or whether they need to be re-examined for the future. It was also address whether the changing climate will impact livestock production in PA and surrounding areas, as well as study how the possible increase of agricultural commodities will impact water quality with increased nutrients entering watersheds. The infrastructure topic will focus on PA's readiness to deal with the recent increase in severe weather events.

Public Comment(s):

John Mellow provided written comments to the CCAC that pertained to Gov. Wolf's Executive Order and the Lackawanna Energy Center power plant.

Ellen Kramer, of Myerstown gave a statement regarding her opposition to utility-installed smart meters. She provided a report to the CCAC members as backup demonstrating the opposition to the installation and adoption of smart meters.

Angel Lorah of Bethlehem detailed how, shortly after the installation of a smart meter at her home and neighborhood, she started suffering symptoms of Electromagnetic Hyper-Sensitivity (EHS) from the electromagnetic frequencies and radiation that the smart meters emit. She finished her statement by urging PA to stop installing smart meters.

Dr. Larry McKnight, a physician, gave a statement on the health effects he has seen from smart meters. Dr. McKnight offered that PA allow an opt-out for residents who have a sensitivity to electromagnetic fields.

Further Discussion:

Robert Graff asked for an update on the Transportation Climate Initiative (TCI). TCI was founded in 2010 out of the Georgetown Climate Center and is made up of North and Mid-Atlantic states from Maine down to Virginia. The goal is to develop a cap and trade program for the transportation sector. DEP has been coordinating with PennDOT on the TCI. The plan is to have policy design completed by the end of 2019.

PA CAP Implementation and Outreach – For Citizens, Businesses & Governments:

Lindsay Byron of DEP asked for feedback on certain actions within the CAP. Specifically, she asked for input on best management practices (BMPs) in agriculture, reducing waste generation, and adaptation strategies for vulnerable populations.

Sara Nicholas suggested starting with DEP's Chesapeake Bay Program, as they could provide helpful feedback. Other feedback included the current state of recycling, as well as focusing on DEP regulations (i.e. waste) that might be an impediment to the CAP goals.

In regard to vulnerable populations, Lindsay Baxter mentioned that energy auditors need to know

where to steer homeowners who have structural issues and not enough money to fix them, as it disqualifies them from weatherization funds.

Terry Bossert suggested reaching out to local boroughs and townships and presenting at their conferences. Steve Krug suggested utilizing social media platforms in order to engage the public, as well as putting out case studies that highlight solutions and successes.

Discussion also touched on how to tailor the CAP message, so that it will encourage all Pennsylvanians to take action. For instance, Sara Nicholas recommended only showing/discussing strategies that are applicable to the audience you are speaking with, and thereby not overwhelming them with info that doesn't pertain to them.

Revised 2018 Greenhouse Gas Inventory Update:

Lindsay Byron gave a brief update on the 2018 Pennsylvania Greenhouse Gas Inventory, based upon comments that were received by the members of CCAC. Some of the comments focused on data that seemed inconsistent with previous years. Lindsay Byron stated that DEP is trying to use more state-specific data instead of defaults. Another focus was on revising numbers for electricity generation, consumption and export.

New Business:

Steve Krug made a motion to send a letter to Paul Opiyo, on behalf of the CCAC, thanking him for being a member, and one of the longest continuously serving. The motion was seconded by Patrick Henderson. A verbal vote took place, and the motion passed unanimously. Mark Hammond was authorized to draft and send the letter on behalf of the committee.

Steve Krug presented an update on progress in the building sector. He said he would like the commonwealth to consider net-zero buildings.

Joe Sherrick, PUC, presented some statistics related to Program Year Nine of Act 129. A total of 1.45 million megawatt hours have been saved from projects implemented in 2017. Annual CO₂ savings were one million tons. He also stated that the cost effectiveness as measured by the Total Resource Cost Test was 1.48, which translates to one dollar and forty-eight cents returned for every dollar spent.

Adjournment:

A motion to adjourn was made by Steve Krug and seconded by Robert Graff. The motion carried, and the meeting was adjourned at 1:52 p.m.