THE PERFECT STORM
Economic Impact of Changes in the Recycling Industry

Robert Anderson
Mid Atlantic Regional Business Development Manager
PA SWAC Meeting January 21, 2016
PUBLIC AND PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS MUST WORK TOGETHER AND ADAPT TO INDUSTRY CHALLENGES
# The Perfect Storm

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Challenge</th>
<th>What Happened</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stream Composition Changes</strong></td>
<td>- Shifts in consumer preferences, increasing levels on non-recyclables in the bin and industry driven product light weighting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rising Labor Cost</strong></td>
<td>- Legislative actions continue to increase minimum wages rates $0.50/hr can increase labor cost by as much as $3 per ton.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Increasing Maintenance / Processing Costs</strong></td>
<td>- Negative effects of stream composition, increased down time due to higher contamination rates and requirements attributed to “green fence”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Depressed Commodity Prices</strong></td>
<td>- Global commodity valuations continue to be depressed with light support for higher prices</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SHIFTING CONSUMER PREFERENCES AND NEW PACKAGING DESIGNS ARE CAUSING A SIGNIFICANT CHANGE IN THE COMPOSITION OF WASTE STREAMS PROCESSED BY MRFS
Increased online consumption of news and media has significantly reduced the amount of newspapers and magazines available to recycle.

Aluminum and metal containers are becoming thinner and lighter, requiring more units and effort at the MRF to collect and sort the same metric tonnage.

Non-recyclable bio-based packaging, like PLA, often gets mixed with recyclables like PET, thus contaminating the stream and reducing overall value.

Manufacturers are seeking out and using flexible composite plastic packaging, instead of paper or glass. These materials are difficult to recycle, if they can be recycled at all.
DECLINE OF NEWSPAPER

• Newsprint Facts (source: EPA)
  o 1960: 7 million tons of newsprint
  o 2000: 15 million tons of newsprint
  o 2012: 8 million tons of newsprint

• Newspaper Circulation Facts
  o 1990: Daily & Sunday papers just under 70% of US households
  o 2010: Daily & Sunday papers under 40% of US households

• Source: Communications Management, Inc. “60 Years of Daily Newspaper Circulation Trends"
ONGOING PLASTIC CONTAINER SOURCE REDUCTION (LIGHTWEIGHTING) BY THE LARGEST CONSUMER PRODUCT COMPANIES REDUCE PLASTIC AVAILABLE FOR RECOVERY
RECYCLABLES WEIGH LESS

- Many packaging types are thinner and lighter than in the past
  - Newspapers reduce paper sheet 10-15% in 2000s
  - 2 liter soda bottle weighs 25% less than in 1970s
  - PET water bottle weights down 32% 2000-2008
  - Aluminum Cans 17% lighter than in 1990
  - Milk jugs (HDPE) 30% lighter than 1980
THIS MEANS FAR MORE UNITS TO SORT TO MAINTAIN SAME WEIGHT OF RECYCLING
TODAY IT TAKES

10,460 MORE
16 OUNCE PLASTIC BOTTLES
TO MAKE
1 TON
OF RECYCLED PET
THAN IN 1980
Coca-Cola has reduced its PET bottle materials by 25%.

Eco-Shape® bottle uses an average of 30% less plastic versus comparable sized carbonated and non-carbonated beverages.

Reduced the amount of materials used to make PET bottles by 60% over the past 22 years.
PepsiCo reduced its packaging by 109 million pounds in 2013, with 23% percent of the savings in PET bottles, closures, and labels.
ALUMINUM AND METAL CONTAINERS ARE UNDERGOING SIMILAR PACKAGE SOURCE REDUCTION TRENDS, REQUIRING MORE UNITS AND LABOR TO ACHIEVE THE SAME OUTPUT
Today it takes 12,100 more 12 ounce aluminum cans to make 1 ton of aluminum than in 1980.
• Many recyclable forms of packaging, such as paper and glass are swiftly losing market share to a diverse variety of non-recyclable plastic packaging

• The flexible packaging industry is one of the fastest growing packaging sectors as companies use increasingly difficult to recycle flexible composite plastic packaging
“VIRTUALLY NONE OF THESE FLEXIBLE PACKAGING MATERIALS ARE RECYCLABLE ANYWHERE IN THE WORLD”

– Natural Resources Defense Council
INCREASE IN FLEXIBLE PACKAGING

• Fast growing packaging trend is flexible plastics
  o Multiple resins combined in single product
  o Very light weight – 1.5 lbs flex plastic replaces:
    - 50 Lbs of Glass
    - 6 Lbs rigid PET
    - 3 Lbs aluminum
  o When empty, is flat and behaves like paper
• These contaminate Recycling Streams
Contamination

Non-recyclable residue and contaminants are consistently high across facilities, lowering plant efficiency and the value of commodities produced.
CONTAMINATION

WISHFUL RECYCLING
Major cause is “wishful recycling.” Residents toss items in the recycling bin/cart, hoping materials can be recycled, even if not officially acceptable.

UNSAFE MATERIALS
Yard waste, wood, hoses, wires, cables as well as bio-waste items medical waste, diapers and needles create extremely dangerous conditions for our employees.

HOUSEHOLD WASTE
Residents in some areas are simply treating the recycling cart as an extra trash can, contaminating the stream with food waste, dirt and plastic bags, which cause significant downtime at the MRF.
DANGEROUS CONTAMINATION

- Lack of care in households for what goes in the recycling container
  - More food waste, other household trash
    - Compost doesn’t belong in recycling
  - Yard waste, wood, hoses, etc. on the rise
  - Increase incidence of bio waste materials
    - Medical wastes made from plastics
    - Used personal hygiene products like diapers
RESIDUE RATES ON THE RISE

• Quantity of non-recyclables on the increase
  o Residue rates in MRFs up 2-3 percentage points

• Quality of non-recyclables getting worse
  o More true trash and bio-waste materials

• Disposal costs going up
  o Lowers ability of recyclers to share revenue

• Lost revenue opportunity
  o Reduced sell ables cuts into available revenue
QUALITY STANDARDS

• As a recycler, we must enforce more stringent quality standards for inbound materials

• We have had an influx of unacceptable materials/contaminated loads at many of our facilities

• Costs time and money to inspect/reject/extract contaminants from the system

• Creates dangerous conditions for our employees
MRF FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE HAS SUFFERED DUE TO THE CUMULATIVE NEGATIVE EFFECT OF STREAM COMPOSITION CHANGES ON PRODUCTIVITY & COMMODITY VALUE
CAUSE & EFFECT
Stream composition changes can directly cost a typical MRF up to nearly $100k per month in lost productivity due to slower throughput, higher residue rates and increased downtime.

LABOR INCREASE
MRFs create opportunity for entry level workers and are sensitive to minimum wage increases. Legislative actions are increasing hourly wages. $0.50/hour increase can raise processing cost by $3/ton.

CPI DISPARITY
Many contracts use CPI as a measure of labor cost increases, however, wages and benefit costs are steadily rising faster than CPI.
RISING COSTS

• MRF must run slower to remove non-recyclable materials when there is higher residue content
  o Monthly throughput decreased 3% from 2012 to 2015 at ReCommunity MRFs

• Additional staff are needed to manually sort stream:
  o Heightened quality requirements
  o Equipment not configured to handle new stream composition
  o Increase in non-recyclable materials which must be screened manually

• High residue content lowers the value of outbound commodities produced
  o Average residue per ton increased from 9% in 2012 to 13% in 2014
PLASTIC FILMS AND BAGS GET TANGLED IN OUR EQUIPMENT, AND OUR CREWS MUST STOP OUR MACHINERY SIX TO EIGHT TIMES A DAY TO CUT THEM OUT

— Waste Management
LABOR COST INCREASES HAVE STEADILY OUTPACED CPI-BASED ADJUSTMENTS CALLED FOR IN MOST OF RECOMMUNITY’S CONTRACTS
IMPACT OF HIGHER WAGES

• Upside: May be easier to attract and retain staff

• Downside: Cost per ton jumps up
  - Every $1 per hour translates to between $1-$6 per ton depending on headcount, throughput rate

• Increased Cost must be accounted for in deal structures; Recyclers can’t absorb this expense

• CPI increases don’t keep up with Wage Rates
IT IS LIKELY THAT FURTHER INCREASES IN THE MINIMUM WAGE BY STATE LEGISLATURES AND INDIVIDUAL COMPANIES WILL CONTINUE
WAGES VS. CPI

R. Squared = 0.6548

WAGES

CPI

RISING COSTS

< BACK
THE MARKET FOR RECYCLED COMMODITIES HAS GLOBALIZED WHILE PRICES FOR ALL RECOVERED MATERIALS HAVE BEEN IN A PROLONGED DECLINE
COMMODITIES

COMMODITY PRICING LOW
ONP & OCC pricing has declined over the past few years. Plastic prices have dropped sharply due to declines in oil pricing.

CHINA CONNECTION
China’s “Operation Green Fence” raised the quality bar, forcing MRF operators to work even harder at producing high quality materials in a complicated stream.

FUTURE UNCERTAIN
Forecasts vary on how long oil prices will stay low. Some industry analysts predict that pricing will not return to higher rates until 2020 or later.
ACR and oil prices* appear to be correlated over the last decade and long dated oil future contracts indicate slow growth in prices over the next four years.

* Past performance is not necessarily indicative of future results
THE COST OF QUALITY

• Higher buyer expectations require more sorting, fewer contaminants

• More sorting requires slower speed, more staff, or both

• Higher quality expectations reduces the possibility of ‘tag along’ recycling of other materials

• Result is higher residue rates in MRFs, and higher sorting costs
WE MUST ACT IN PARTNERSHIP TO ADAPT TO THE STRUCTURAL CHANGES FACING THE INDUSTRY AND SECURE THE LONG-TERM SUSTAINABILITY OF RECYCLING PROGRAMS
### THE PERFECT STORM

#### CHALLENGE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STREAM COMPOSITION CHANGES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RISING LABOR COST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INCREASING MAINTENANCE / PROCESSING COSTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEPRESSED COMMODITY PRICES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### ACTION

- Increase community education to reduce non-recyclables in the waste stream
- Adopt a more appropriate measure of labor cost inflation which captures the true cost of providing employment
- Reassess processing fees based on the updated operating costs reflective of current MRF performance
  - Share the maintenance and disposal costs for excess residue and contamination levels
- Revise revenue sharing provisions to share commodity risk more equitably
NEED FOR STRUCTURAL CHANGE

- Recycling cannot be seen as ‘free’
- Recyclers cannot bear the combination of higher costs and lower revenues
- Residents need to understand and take on the cost of recycling
SUSTAINABLE DEAL STRUCTURE SUPPORTS MRF INVESTMENTS IN LOW MARKETS WHILE OFFERING INCREASED VALUE TO CONSUMERS WHEN MARKETS RETURN
THANK YOU