

**CLIMATE CHANGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MEETING MINUTES**

July 12, 2016

10:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m.

Conference Room 105

Rachel Carson State Office Building

MEMBERS/ALTERNATES PRESENT:

Chairperson Steve Krug, Vice-Chairperson Mark Hammond, Sarah Nicholas, Joe Sherrick, Paul Opiyo, Terry Bossert, George Ellis, Rob Graff, Patrick Henderson, Gary Merritt, Steve Winberg, Grant Gulibon (alternate for Luke Brubaker).

MEMBERS/ALTERNATES ABSENT:

Rep. Greg Vitali, Rep. Ryan Bizzaro, Jim Warner, Mike Winek

PROXY VOTING:

None

PA DEP AND COMMONWEALTH AGENCY STAFF :

Frank Purtell (DEP), John Krueger (DEP), Hayley Book (DEP), Mark Brojakowski (DEP) Dennis Maloskey (DEP), Katherine Hetherington Cunfer (DEP), Catherine D. Haffner (PGC), Diana M. Day (PF&BC)

MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC:

Laura Legere (Pittsburgh Post-Gazette), Mark Richards (EDF), Nathan Larkin (EDF), Marc Mondor (Alternate for Mr. Krug)

REGULAR MEETING:

The July 12, 2016, regular meeting of the Climate Change Advisory Committee (CCAC) was called to order at 10:07 a.m. by Chairperson Steve Krug. Roll call was taken and, with 10 members present at the start of the meeting, a quorum was established. Members, DEP staff and guests introduced themselves.

MINUTES:

The minutes for the May 17, 2016, Climate Change Advisory Committee (CCAC) meeting were presented to the committee for approval by Mr. Krug. A motion to accept the minutes was made by Mr. Ellis and was seconded. The motion carried by voice vote.

MEETING SUMMARY: (This narrative provides a summary of the discussions that took place during the meeting. It is not a transcript of the proceedings.)

AGENCY PRESENTATIONS:

DEP's climate change program's Mr. Frank Purtell offered the CCAC a PowerPoint presentation on the 2016 Pennsylvania Greenhouse Gas Draft Emissions Inventory. The presentation, although in draft form, highlighted the latest (2013) data available in EPA's draft State Inventory Tool (SIT) and identified emissions and trends for seven sectors in PA. A point made in the presentation is how the

Landfill Gas to Energy (LFGTE) draft default data used in the SIT has changed dramatically from the previously reported (2102) SIT data. Mr. Purtell noted that the LFGTE data is still under discussion with U.S. EPA. Mark Hammond noted that U.S. EPA has told national stakeholders that they agree there are unresolved issues with the draft data, and also that US EPA has agreed to convene a stakeholder group this summer to resolve the issues.

Mr. Purtell expects to verify the emissions numbers presented in this draft report once the LFGTE issue is fully resolved. The preliminary emissions numbers show an increase of nearly 10 MMTCO₂e from all sectors combined in PA between the 2012 and 2013. The presentation was followed by a question-and-answer period where multiple committee comments were expressed on various sector emissions increases.

The PA Public Utility Commission's Mr. Joe Sherrick offered a presentation on the Commission's Proposed Policy Statement on Combined Heat and Power (CHP) and the Commission's Combined Heat and Power for Resiliency Accelerator Partnership Agreement. The presentation highlighted the PUC's comprehensive efforts to support the further development of CHP systems to help fulfill the Commission's responsibility to promote energy efficiency and to recognize that some of the benefits of CHP, such as economic development and reduced air emissions transcend the Commission's jurisdiction and responsibility. The CHP Resiliency Accelerator program will demonstrate opportunities for CHP to be best utilized for critical infrastructure resiliency. The presentation was followed by a question-and-answer period. Mr. Krug added that the CCAC had developed a CHP work plan in the upcoming 2015 Pennsylvania Climate Change Action Plan Update.

The PA Game Commission's Catherine D. Haffner and the PA Fish and Boat Commission's Diana Day offered a PowerPoint presentation on the "2015 Pennsylvania Wildlife Action Plan". The presentation highlighted: a history of State Wildlife Plans, the importance of State and Tribal Wildlife Grants, the context of the plan, the importance of the Plan to Pennsylvanians, the statewide impacts on fish, amphibians, reptiles, mussels, birds and mammals. Also included were the required elements of the State Wildlife Action Plans, a mention of climate change impacts and background and concepts. The presentation was followed by a question-and-answer period.

MEMBERSHIP UPDATE:

The CCAC now carries five vacancies along with four appointed seats expiring in 2016 on its membership roster. The Department has submitted recommendations for two of the expiring seat reappointments and one vacant Governor's appointment. DEP continues to work on filling these vacancies. In addition, the terms of two other members will expire in 2016. The members whose terms expire were encouraged to contact their representative appointing authority to request reappointment.

2015 CLIMATE CHANGE ACTION PLAN (Update):

Ms. Hayley Book of DEP's Policy Office update the committee on the status of the 2015 Pennsylvania Climate Change Action Plan (Update). Ms. Book reported that the final edits are being made to both the Update and the Public Comment Response Document (C/R). Notice of the release of the two documents will be published in the July 30, 2016 Pennsylvania Bulletin at which time the Update and the C/R will be presented to the Governor and the legislators. Mr. Ellis requested that CCAC members receive the documents prior to the public release of the documents.

DEVELOPMENT OF THE 2018 CLIMATE CHANGE ACTION PLAN UPDATE:

Mr. Krug led of the discussion by saying the committee should focus on procedure, schedule and topics. Many of the members voiced their opinions on approach the CCAC and the DEP should take for the development of the 2018 Update. The consensus of members centered around developing a new approach to develop the update, something more than revisiting and tweaking work plans from the 40 or 50 already utilized in the previous action plans. Suggestions to look at other state's climate change action plans for ideas along with focusing on PA's heaviest emitters to develop plans to reduce our carbon footprint. It was also suggested that the next update address our greenhouse gas emissions and policies based on their effect on the global climate change issue. A general consensus of the CCAC was that it would be useful for DEP to analyze the previous recommendations and the legislative effectiveness to determine what it was that made them meaningful (determine which work plans were successful and which were not).

Another topic of discussion was the issue of climate change adaptation and the Commonwealth's preparedness for climate change. A suggestion was made to update the 2014 *Pennsylvania Climate Adaptation Planning Report*, including reforming the four working groups for the report (Infrastructure, Natural Resources, Tourism and Outdoor Recreation, Public Health and Safety). It was also suggested that the list of "other state's action plans" that was developed earlier by the Department be revisited to obtain ideas and other options for the development of the next Update. The committee also inquired about the availability of a published Best Practice Guide for climate change action plans.

The time line for the next update was also discussed. When the next update is due was discussed among a number of members. The main topic being whether under Act 70, the update is due every three years from the anniversary date of the first Pennsylvania Action Plan or is it due three years from the delivery date of the previous action plan. Reason being; if the plan was due three years after the previous update the next update would not be due until July of 2019, and not October of 2018. This would afford the committee a longer time window with which to advise the DEP on the development of the Update. The committee requested that the Department obtain a legal interpretation of the language contained in Act 70 pertaining to the responsibilities (report due) of the DEP and the action plan requirements. The DEP agreed to obtain a legal interpretation from a Department lawyer on that specific language. The possibility of interim reports on the progress made with greenhouse gas mitigation as a result of previous work plans and legislative recommendations was also a topic of discussion.

The use of outside contractors for help with the development of the next update was also discussed. The selection of contractors and the RFP process for contractual work was also mentioned as being a part of the Update process that the committee should be involved in. Earlier engagement of the macroeconomic analysis contractor would be a useful iterative process in analyzing work plans that make the most sense and provide for the most economic benefits.

The committee also noted that the Clean Power Plan, although not being actively pursued at this time, is something that should not be overlooked and should remain a part of the committee's focus for the next Update.

The Department suggested that the committee focus and the greenhouse gas heavy sectors were we can gain the most reductions, get contractors (macroeconomic analysis) involved sooner in the process and revisit the Climate Change Adaptation Report and re-establish the work groups used in that report as we address climate change adaptation in the next update.

PUBLIC COMMENT(S):

Sue Edwards, of the Sierra Club, addressed the CCAC concerning the lack of use of SCR technology at the Bruner Island Steam Electric Station and the effects of the NOx pollution emitted by the plant. She also noted that Delaware filed a petition asking the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency to determine that the coal-fired Bruner Island power plant significantly contributes to Delaware's ozone problem. She also noted that the state of Connecticut filed a similar petition with the EPA.

Karen Mehton, Citizens Climate Lobby and Philadelphia resident, addressed the CCAC concerning citizen opposition to a natural gas cogeneration plant, CHP plant, proposed for the Philadelphia area by SEPTA. She stated that there no justification for burning any additional fossil fuels, in neighborhoods already suffering from high pollution levels. She also expressed concerns about the potential for spiking asthma rates and SEPTA's fiscal irresponsibility

ADJOURNMENT:

A motion to adjourn was made by Mr. Graff and seconded. The motion carried, and the meeting was adjourned at 1:58 p.m.