

April 2, 2020

John Forbes
Plant Manager
Brunner Island LLC
1400 Wago Road, PO Box 221
York Haven, PA 17347

Re: Consent Decree
Brunner Island
NPDES Permit No. PA0008281
East Manchester Township, York County

Dear Mr. Forbes:

On February 6, 2020, the Department received Brunner Island's Black Gut Creek Sampling Plan ("Plan") in accordance with Paragraph 37 of the Consent Decree entered on November 8, 2019.

The Department and EIP reviewed and commented on the Plan and Brunner e-mailed a revised Plan to the Department on March 26, 2020.

The Department has reviewed the revised Plan and approves it with the following comments:

1. DEP does not intend to use the data collected to determine if Black Gut Creek is attaining or impaired for aquatic use.
2. Sampling downstream of a tributary may alter the water chemistry. The upper limit of Reach 1 is an unnamed tributary. The lower limit of Reach 1 is the Susquehanna River. If there is significant flow from the unnamed tributary, complete mix may not be achieved before the confluence with the Susquehanna. Similarly, seeps and outfalls may "hug" the bank and not mix with the inner channel. The proximity of the lower site to the River would likely display impacts from flow variability. DEP would expect Reach 3 to be different than Reach 1 and 2, because the downstream reaches are in a channelized area and DEP expects marked differences between that type of site and one that is relatively undisturbed like Reach 3.
3. It is unknown how various macroinvertebrates respond to many of the constituents of concern especially when those constituents are in combination. If the objective is to determine impacts of the contaminants of concern on the macroinvertebrate community, it will be difficult due to many confounding factors with this study area including the physical differences in the stream channels.

Mr. John Forbes

- 2 -

April 2, 2020

Please submit a hard copy of the revised Plan to the Department by April 15, 2020.

If you have any questions concerning this letter, please contact Victor Landis at 717.705.4772 or vlandis@pa.gov.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Maria D. Bebenek". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "M".

Maria D. Bebenek, P.E.
Environmental Program Manager
Clean Water Program

cc: Craig Shamory - Brunner Island LLC, 600 Hamilton Street Suite 600,
Allentown, PA 18101

Mary Green – Deputy Director, Environmental Integrity Project, 1000
Vermont Avenue NW, Ste. 1100, Washington, DC 20005

Mr. John Forbes

- 3 -

April 2, 2020

bcc: M. Bebenek (pdf)
P. Kwezda (pdf)
V. Landis (pdf)
A Bransteitter (pdf)
J. Williams (pdf)
File
T